

ONLINE APPENDIX TO

“THE USE AND USEFULNESS OF BIG DATA IN FINANCE”

Figure A1  
List of Alternative Data Vendors and In-house Data Science Teams

We compile a list of data-science teams and alternative-data vendors by combining the vendor list of AlternativeData.org, a platform that connects users to providers of alternative data, with that of J. P. Morgan's 2019 Alternative Data Handbook. The figure below lists all the seven in-house data-science teams and all the 513 alternative-data vendors. \*denote in-house data-science teams.

AlphaWise (Morgan Stanley)\*

Barclays Investment Sciences and Data Science Team (Barclays)\*

Piper Jaffray Web Analytics (PiperJaffray, now Piper Sandler Companies)\*

RBC Elements (Royal Bank of Canada)\*

UBS Evidence Lab (UBS)\*

Wolfe quant team (Wolfe Research)\*

Kyber Data Science (Cowen)\*

|                       |                       |                     |                      |
|-----------------------|-----------------------|---------------------|----------------------|
| 1010Data              | Beijing Chuang Yi     | CQG                 | ENGAGE Research      |
| 7Park                 | Fang Technology       | Crain               | Enigma               |
| Aberdeen              | Beijing UC Science &  | Communications Inc. | Entgroup             |
| Accern                | Technology            | CreditRiskMonitor   | EntSight             |
| Accrete               | Benzinga              | Crimson Hexagon     | EOOData              |
| Aclima                | Big Byte Insights     | Croprosis           | EPFR                 |
| Acuris                | Bird.i                | CropProphet         | Epsilon              |
| AddThis               | Bitly                 | CrowdThnk           | eSignal              |
| Advan                 | Bitvore               | Cruise Analytics    | Estimize             |
| Affinity Solutions    | BizQualify            | Cuebiq              | Eurekahedge          |
| AggData               | Black Box (TDn2k)     | Cuemacro            | Euromonitor          |
| Agribotix             | Black Sky             | CyberStream         | International        |
| Agricultural Research | Bloomberg Tesla       | Data Guru Limited   | Event Registry       |
| Federation            | Tracker               | Data Simply         | EventVestor          |
| Airports Council      | BMLL Technology       | Datalogix           | Everest Group        |
| International         | Bombora               | Dataminr            | Exante Data          |
| AirSage               | Borrell               | Datamyne            | Exerica              |
| ALASA                 | Boxoffice Media       | Dataprovider.com    | Experian Footfall    |
| Alexandria            | Brain Company         | DataPulse           | ExtractAlpha         |
| AllTheRooms           | BrandLoyalties        | Datarama            | FactSet Revere       |
| Almax Information     | BrandWatch            | DataSift            | FactSquared          |
| Systems               | Brave New Coin        | Datastoxx           | Fashionbi            |
| Alpha Hat             | Brickstream           | DataStreamx         | FastBooking          |
| AlphaFlow             | Bridg                 | DataTrek            | FeatureX             |
| AlphaLetters          | Broughton Capital     | DataWeave           | FHS - Swiss Watch    |
| Alphamatician         | Buddy                 | DataYes             | Data                 |
| Alphasense            | BuildFax              | Dawex               | Finweavers           |
| Alt Hub               | BuiltWith             | DecaData            | First Data Merchant  |
| Alternate DNS         | Business Intelligence | DeepAffects         | Services Corporation |
| Amareos               | Advisors              | Del Mar Networks    | First Data           |
| Amass Insights        | Business Monitor      | Delphia             | SpendTrend           |
| Amenity Analytics     | International         | DemystData          | First to Invest      |
| American Trucking     | Capella Space         | Descartes Labs      | Flexport             |
| Association           | CB Richard Ellis Inc. | Digital Globe       | FN Arena             |
| Ampere Analysis       | CDU-TEK: Central      | DigitalMR           | FNGO                 |
| Anonymous Provider    | Dispatching           | Doane Advisory      | Foursquare           |
| AnthemData            | Department of Fuel    | Service             | Fraud Factors        |
| Apertio Technologies  | Energy Complex of     | Dodge               | Freestyle Media      |
| ApexData              | Russia                | Drawbridge          | FreightWaves         |
| AppAnnie              | Chain Store Guide     | Drewry Shipping     | FTR Freight          |
| Applaudience          | Information Services  | Consultants Ltd     | Transport Research   |
| Apptopia              | ChemOrbis             | Drillinginfo        | Associates           |
| Arab Air Carrier      | China National        | DroneDeploy         | Fysical              |
| Organization          | Chemical Information  | Dun & Bradstreet    | GDELT                |
| Arabesque S Ray       | Center                | EagleAlpha          | Genscape             |
| ARC                   | China Real Estate     | Earnest Research    | Geocento             |
| Arch Metrics          | Information           | Earthcube           | GeoQuant             |
| AreaMetrics           | Corporation           | EcommerceDB         | GeoSpark Analytics,  |
| ARM Insight           | Civic Science         | Edison              | Inc                  |
| Ascend Worldwide      | ClipperData           | Edmunds             | Geospatial Insight   |
| Limited               | CogniSent             | EEDAR               | Geotab               |
| Astutex               | Comlinkdata           | Eilers & Krejcik    | GeoWiki              |
| Audit Analytics       | CompStak              | Gaming              | GfK Boutique         |
| aWhere                | ComScore              | Emolument           | Research             |
| Barchart              | Consumer Edge         | Endor               |                      |
| BayStreet Research    | Cooltrader            | EnerKnol            |                      |

|                       |                     |                       |                      |
|-----------------------|---------------------|-----------------------|----------------------|
| Global Tone           | IPquery             | MixRank               | PsychSignal          |
| Communication         | iResearch           | MKT Mediastat         | QL2                  |
| (GTCOM)               | Irisys              | Mobiquity Networks    | Quad Analytix        |
| GNIP                  | iSentia             | Money Dashboard       | Quandl               |
| Good Judgment         | iSentium            | MoneySuperMarket      | Quantcube            |
| GovSpend              | iSpot               | NAIP                  | Quantxt              |
| Grandata              | ISS Analytics       | Narrative.io          | Quest Offshore       |
| Granular.ai           | ISSB Ltd            | New Generation        | QuestMobile          |
| Grapedata             | Jettrack.io         | Research              | Quexopa              |
| Greenwich.HR          | Jiguang             | Newscred              | Rakuten Intelligence |
| Gro Intelligence      | Jumpshot            | Newswhip              | RandomWalk           |
| GroundTruth (xAd)     | JustData            | Nexant Inc.           | RavenPack            |
| GS Dataworks          | JWN Energy          | NEXRAD on AWS         | Real Capital         |
| Guidepoint            | Kayros              | NIC                   | Analytics            |
| Gyana                 | KD Interactive      | Nikkei                | Real Estate Data     |
| h2o                   | Knowsis             | Nowcast               | Realrents            |
| Headset               | Kpler               | NPD                   | Realyse              |
| Health Forum          | ktMINE              | Off-Highway           | Re-analytics         |
| HealthVerity          | Kyber Data Science  | Research Limited      | Redbook Research     |
| Heckyl                | Landsat on AWS:     | Omega Point: a PM     | Inc.                 |
| HFR                   | Legal Shield        | platform with AI      | RedTech              |
| Hillside Partners     | Legis               | intelligence          | REIS                 |
| humanpredictions      | Lexalytics          | Omney Data            | RelateTheNews        |
| Huq Industries        | LikeFolio           | One Click Retail      | RelationshipScience  |
| HySpecIQ              | LIMRA               | OpenCorporates        | RepRisk              |
| ICEYE                 | LinkUp              | OpenSignal            | Repustate            |
| ICI                   | LISTedTECH          | OpenstreetMap         | RetailNext           |
| IFI CLAIMS Patent     | ListenFirst         | Optimum Complexity    | Return Path          |
| Services              | Lota Data           | Orb Intelligence      | Reveal Mobile        |
| iiMedia Research      | Lucena Research     | Orbital Insight       | Revelio Labs         |
| IMS Quintiles         | Lyra Insight        | OTAS                  | Reviewshake          |
| Index Marketing       | M Science           | Ovum Ltd Us Branch    | Rezatec              |
| Solutions Limited     | Magna Global        | Owl Analytics         | Rigdata              |
| IndexMath             | Research            | Pacific Epoch (China) | RigLogix             |
| Inferess              | Manfredi &          | Panjiva               | Rigup                |
| InformaFinancialIntel | Associates          | Panvista Analytics    | Rook Research        |
| ligence               | Manheim             | Parsely               | RootMetrics          |
| InfoTEK Publishing    | MariData            | PatentSight           | RS Metrics           |
| House                 | MarineTraffic       | PatSnap               | RunningAlpha         |
| InfoTrie              | Marinexplore        | Paynxt360             | RVIA                 |
| Innovata              | MarketCheck         | Percolata             | RxData.net           |
| Inovayt               | MarketPsych         | PipeCandy             | Rystad Energy        |
| Insights Data         | Marketscout         | Pitchbook             | Safegraph            |
| Solutions             | Corporation         | PlaceIQ               | Sandalwood           |
| InSpectrum            | MASSIVE Data        | Placemeter            | Satellite Imaging    |
| Intelius              | Heights             | Placer.ai             | Corporation          |
| Interconnect          | MasterCard Advisors | Planet Labs           | SatScout             |
| Analytics             | MatterMark          | Pluribus Labs         | Savvr                |
| Intermodal            | Mavrx               | Prattle               | SciDex Alpha         |
| Association of North  | Measurable AI       | Predata               | Scoop Analytics      |
| America               | MedMine             | Predict HQ            | Scrapehero           |
| International Data    | Meltwater           | Premonition           | Scutify              |
| Corporation Inc.      | Metricle            | PriceStats            | Second Measure       |
| Internet Truckstop    | MIDiA Research      | PROME                 | Seer Aerospace       |
| Intrinio              | Millennium Research | Prosper Insights &    | Selerity             |
| Investing.com         | Group Inc.          | Analytics             |                      |

|  |  |   |
|--|--|---|
| Semiconductor<br>Equipment &<br>Materials<br>International<br>Semlab<br>Sense360<br>Sensor Tower<br>Sentifi<br>Sentiment Trader<br>Sequentum<br>SESAMm<br>Sg2 (MarketPulse)<br>Sharablee<br>ShareIQ<br>ShareThis<br>ShareThis, Inc.<br>ShopperTrak<br>Shoppertrak Rct<br>Corporation<br>Sigmai<br>Signal.co<br>SimilarWeb<br>SJ Consulting Group<br>Inc.<br>Sky Watch<br>Skydeo<br>Slice Intelligence<br>Slingshot Aerospace<br>SmarterWorks<br>SMB Intelligence<br>Smith Travel<br>SNL Kagan<br>Social Alpha<br>Social Market<br>Analytics<br>Space Know<br>SpaceKnow<br>Spacelist<br>SpaceNet on AWS<br>Spire Global<br>Spring Pond Partners<br>Standard Media Index<br>Statistical Survey<br>Statlas<br>Stax<br>Steel Orbis<br>StockTwits<br>STR<br>StreetLight Data<br>Suburbia<br>SumZero<br>SuperData<br>SuperFly<br>Superfly insights<br>Sustainalytics<br>Suzy | T.H. Capital<br>Tailwind Imaging<br>Tala<br>Talismatic<br>TalkingData<br>Tecnon Orbichem<br>Tegus<br>TellusLabs<br>Teragence<br>Terra Bella<br>Terrain Tiles<br>TerraQuanta<br>Thasos<br>The Climate<br>Corporation<br>The Fertilizer Institute<br>TheySay<br>Thinknum<br>ThinkTopic<br>TickerTags<br>Tipigo<br>Tipranks<br>TMT Analysis<br>Towergate<br>Informatics<br>Trackur<br>Tradesparq<br>TransCore<br>Transport Topics<br>Publishing Group<br>Trendeo<br>Tribe Dynamics<br>Triton Research<br>TrustData<br>TrustedInsight<br>TruValue Labs<br>Tussell<br>TVeyes<br>TXN<br>TYR Data<br>Uber Media<br>Umbra Lab<br>Unacast<br>Understory<br>Unmetric<br>Upswell Group<br>Ursa<br>Urthecast<br>Venpath<br>Verbatim Advisory<br>Group<br>Veronis Suhler<br>Stevenson<br>Vertical Knowledge<br>Verto Analytics<br>Vessel Finder | VesselsValue<br>Vestdata<br>VidaMinds<br>Vigilant<br>Vortexa<br>Wall Street Horizon<br>Wards Automotive<br>Group<br>Waste Analytics<br>WDZJ.com<br>Webhose.io<br>Wikimapia<br>Windward<br>Woodseer<br>World View<br>WXshift<br>Xebral<br>X-mode<br>Yewno<br>YipitData<br>Yodlee / Envestnet<br>Zaoshu.io<br>Zephyr<br>Zhiwei Data |
|--|--|---|

Table A1

## Number and Fraction of Firms by Industry: Our Sample versus the CRSP/Compustat Universe

In this table we present the numbers of firms in our sample by Global Industry Classification Standard (GICS) industry sector, the fractions of firms that are in the corresponding GICS industry sectors, the numbers of firms in the CRSP/Compustat universe by GICS industry sector, the fractions of firms that are in the corresponding GICS industry sectors, and the combined market values of the firms in our sample as a percentage of the combined market values of all firms in the CRSP/Compustat universe by GICS industry sector. Our sample contains all firms in the Dow Jones Industrial Average Index from June 1 2009 through May 31 2019.

|                        | Our<br>Sample | %   | CRSP/Compustat<br>Universe | %   | $\frac{\sum \text{Market Value}_{\text{Our Sample}}}{\sum \text{Market Value}_{\text{CRSP/Compustat}}}$ |
|------------------------|---------------|-----|----------------------------|-----|---|
| Energy                 | 2             | 6%  | 362                        | 8%  | 17%   |
| Materials              | 2             | 6%  | 261                        | 5%  | 9%  |
| Industrials            | 5             | 14% | 577                        | 12% | 17%   |
| Consumer Discretionary | 3             | 9%  | 519                        | 11% | 11%   |
| Consumer Staples       | 5             | 14% | 166                        | 3%  | 31%   |
| Health Care            | 4             | 11% | 882                        | 18% | 22%   |
| Financials             | 5             | 14% | 816                        | 17% | 13%   |
| Information Technology | 6             | 17% | 632                        | 13% | 40%   |
| Communication Services | 3             | 9%  | 220                        | 5%  | 16%   |
| Utilities              | 0             | 0%  | 107                        | 2%  | 0%  |
| Real Estate            | 0             | 0%  | 234                        | 5%  | 0%  |

Table A2  
How Much Incremental Insight Is There in Alternative Data? Using Absolute Forecast Error

This table replicates Table 3, but the dependent variable is now the absolute forecast error of analyst  $i$  predicting earnings of firm  $j$ , scaled by the absolute value of the actual earnings, multiplied by (-1). We report  $t$ -statistics in parentheses. We double-cluster our standard errors at the analyst- and year-month levels. \*, \*\*, and \*\*\* denote statistical significance at the 10%, 5%, and 1% level, respectively.

|                                      | (1)                  | (2)                  |
|--------------------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|
| <i>I(Alternative Data)</i>           | 0.013**<br>(3.98)    |                      |
| <i>I(Category = App Usage)</i>       |                      | 0.020***<br>(2.45)   |
| <i>I(Category = Sentiment)</i>       |                      | 0.011*<br>(1.75)     |
| <i>I(Category = Employee)</i>        |                      | 0.005<br>(0.81)      |
| <i>I(Category = Geospatial)</i>      |                      | -0.011**<br>(-2.50)  |
| <i>I(Category = Point of Sale)</i>   |                      | 0.004<br>(1.48)      |
| <i>I(Category = Satellite Image)</i> |                      | 0.008<br>(0.73)      |
| <i>I(Category = Web Traffic)</i>     |                      | 0.014**<br>(2.06)    |
| <i>I(Category = Others)</i>          |                      | 0.016***<br>(3.00)   |
| <i>Forecast Age</i>                  | -0.022***<br>(-9.73) | -0.022***<br>(-9.71) |
| <i>Analyst/Firm Experience</i>       | -0.003<br>(-0.62)    | -0.003<br>(-0.65)    |
| <i>Analyst Experience</i>            | 0.010*<br>(2.08)     | 0.010**<br>(2.08)    |
| <i>#Firms Covered</i>                | 0.005<br>(1.18)      | 0.005<br>(1.15)      |
| <i>Forecast Frequency</i>            | 0.004<br>(1.55)      | 0.003<br>(1.51)      |
| <i>Broker Size</i>                   | -0.000<br>(-1.62)    | -0.000*<br>(-1.70)   |
| Analyst-Firm Fixed Effects           | Yes                  | Yes                  |
| Firm-Year Fixed Effects              | Yes                  | Yes                  |
| <i>N</i>                             | 64,036               | 64,036               |
| Adjusted $R^2$                       | 0.822                | 0.822                |

Table A3  
Summary Statistics

This table reports summary statistics for all variables in our main tests. Appendix 2 defines all variables. All continuous variables are winsorized at the 1% and 99% levels.

| Variables   | Mean<br>(1) | SD<br>(2) | P25<br>(3) | P50<br>(4) | P75<br>(5) | # of Obs.<br>(6) |
|---|-------------|-----------|------------|------------|------------|------------------|
| <i>Acc</i>  | 0.013       | 0.751     | -0.393     | 0.152      | 0.601      | 64,036           |
| <i>I(Alternative Data)</i>                          | 0.088       | 0.283     | 0          | 0          | 0          | 64,036           |
| <i>Forecast Age</i>                                 | 4.913       | 1.120     | 4.575      | 5.236      | 5.631      | 64,036           |
| <i>Analyst/Firm Experience</i>                      | 6.691       | 6.828     | 1.781      | 4.510      | 9.189      | 64,036           |
| <i>Analyst Experience</i>                           | 13.873      | 9.541     | 5.732      | 11.934     | 21.904     | 64,036           |
| <i>#Firms Covered</i>                               | 2.907       | 0.370     | 2.708      | 2.944      | 3.135      | 64,036           |
| <i>Forecast Frequency</i>                           | 6.362       | 0.679     | 6.038      | 6.450      | 6.819      | 64,036           |
| <i>Broker Size</i>                                  | 87.102      | 50.213    | 47         | 84         | 116        | 64,036           |
| <i>Number of 8-Ks</i>                               | 15.704      | 7.310     | 10         | 14         | 21         | 64,036           |
| <i>Return Volatility</i>                            | 0.012       | 0.005     | 0.009      | 0.011      | 0.013      | 64,036           |
| <i>Earnings Surprise</i>                            | 0.001       | 0.016     | -0.002     | 0.001      | 0.004      | 64,036           |
| <i>I(Earnings Restatement)</i>                      | 0.320       | 0.466     | 0          | 0          | 1          | 64,036           |
| <i>Discretionary Accruals</i>                       | 0.111       | 0.151     | 0.018      | 0.063      | 0.141      | 64,036           |
| <i>I(Lack of Preferential Access to Management)</i> | 0.752       | 0.432     | 1          | 1          | 1          | 64,036           |
| <i>I(In-House Data Science Team)</i>                | 0.158       | 0.365     | 0          | 0          | 0          | 64,036           |
| $\sum$ <i>Colleagues Alternative Data</i>           | 2.807       | 2.667     | 1          | 2          | 4          | 64,036           |
| <i>Size</i>   | 11.769      | 0.779     | 11.217     | 11.854     | 12.263     | 64,036           |
| <i>M/B</i>  | 4.256       | 5.503     | 1.859      | 2.921      | 4.484      | 64,036           |
| <i>Momentum</i>                                     | 0.083       | 0.154     | -0.013     | 0.076      | 0.177      | 64,036           |
| <i>Cumulative Abnormal Returns</i>                  | -0.033      | 2.686     | -1.245     | -0.030     | 1.217      | 64,007           |
| <i>Earnings Forecast Change</i>                     | 0.001       | 0.033     | 0          | 0          | 0          | 57,761           |
| <i>Target Price Change</i>                          | 0.008       | 0.047     | 0          | 0          | 0          | 55,432           |
| <i>Recommendation Change</i>                        | 0.000       | 0.156     | 0          | 0          | 0          | 60,363           |



#### Description of Analysis Tabulated in Online Appendix Table A4

An analyst's decision to adopt alternative data may coincide with an analyst's decision to exert greater effort covering the corresponding firm. To assess the relevance of this possibility, we construct measures of analyst effort that have been used in prior literature (Merkley, Michaely, and Pacelli [2017], Hwang, Liberti, and Sturgess [2019], Grennan and Michaely [2020]). We then test whether the adoption of alternative data comes with greater effort.

Our regression equation is similar to regression equation (6):

$$Effort_{i,f,t} = \eta_{i,f} + \theta_{f,t} + \beta I(Alternative\ Data_{i,f,t}) + \gamma' Controls + \varepsilon_{i,f,t} \quad (9)$$

First, for each analyst/firm/year, we compute the number of days between the earnings announcement and the analyst's most recent forecast prior to the corresponding earnings announcement, multiplied by (-1). We also compute the number of forecast revisions made by the corresponding analyst for the corresponding firm's earnings. Analysts who exert greater effort should issue earnings forecasts that are less stale (Merkley, Michaely, and Pacelli [2017]) and, in general, update their earnings forecasts more frequently (Hwang, Liberti, and Sturgess [2019]).

Motivated by Grennan and Michaely [2020], we also construct the following measures based on analysts' earnings conference call behavior. First, we construct an indicator, which equals one if the analyst participated in the earning conference call discussing the corresponding firm's annual earnings and zero otherwise. Within the subset of analysts who participate in an earnings conference call, we also construct: (a) the total number of questions posed by the analyst, (b) the total number of words spoken by the analyst, (c) *Easy-to-measure Earnings Topics*, which, following Grennan and Michaely [2020] equals one if an analyst's questions contain the words "sale," "margin," "price," or "capital," and (d) *Hard-to-measure Earnings Topics*, which, following Grennan and Michaely equals one if an analyst's questions contain the words "adapt," "brand," "engage," or "technology." We obtain our earnings conference call data through Refinitiv.

We report our findings in Table A4. For our regressions based on analysts' forecasts, we find that the estimates of  $I(Alternative\ Data)$  are small in magnitude and not statistically significant. That is, we find that the adoption of alternative data changes neither the timeliness of forecasts nor the number of forecast revisions.

Similarly, for our regressions based on analysts' conference call behavior, we find that the adoption of alternative data changes neither the number of questions asked, nor the number of words spoken, nor the types of

questions asked. We do find that adopting alternative data marginally increases the likelihood of attending a conference call; the corresponding estimate of  $I(\textit{Alternative Data})$  is 0.040 ( $t$ -statistic = 1.67).

Table A4  
Alternative Data Adoption and Analyst Effort

This table reports coefficient estimates from regressions of various measures of analyst effort on whether an analyst explicitly references the use of alternative data in her written report. The observations are at the analyst/firm/year level. The regressions are identical to that in column (1) of Table 3, except that the dependent variables are proxies for analyst effort. In column (1), analyst effort is measured by the number of forecast revisions made by the corresponding analyst for the corresponding firm's earnings. In column (2), analyst effort is measured by the number of days between the date of the analyst's last forecast prior to the earnings announcement date and the earnings announcement date, multiplied by (-1). The dependent variables in columns (3) through columns (7) are an indicator if the analyst participated in the earning conference call discussing the corresponding firm's annual earnings, the total number of questions posed by the analyst, the total number of words spoken by the analyst, and whether the analyst's questions pertained to "easy-to-measure earnings topics," or "hard-to-measure earnings topics." We no longer include *Forecast Age* and *Forecast Frequency* as controls. We report *t*-statistics in parentheses. We double-cluster our standard errors at the analyst- and year-month levels. \*, \*\*, and \*\*\* denote statistical significance at the 10%, 5%, and 1% level, respectively.

|                                | Analyst Forecasts and Reports             |                                  | Conference Call Behavior |  |                                     |                                     |                                     |
|--------------------------------|---|----------------------------------|--------------------------|--|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
|                                | Number of<br>Forecast<br>Revisions<br>(1) | Timeliness of<br>Forecast<br>(2) | Attendance<br>(3)        | Number of<br>Questions<br>Asked<br>(4) | Number of<br>Words<br>Spoken<br>(5) | Easy-to-<br>Measure<br>Topic<br>(6) | Hard-to-<br>Measure<br>Topic<br>(7) |
| <i>I(Alternative Data)</i>     | 0.059<br>(0.46)                           | 0.919<br>(0.26)                  | 0.040*<br>(1.67)         | -0.048<br>(-0.31)                      | -2.281<br>(-0.47)                   | -0.074<br>(-1.26)                   | -0.027<br>(-0.99)                   |
| <i>Analyst/Firm Experience</i> | 0.023<br>(0.40)                           | 3.296<br>(1.22)                  | 0.004<br>(0.55)          | 0.017<br>(0.46)                        | 0.743<br>(0.37)                     | -0.026<br>(-1.04)                   | -0.009<br>(-0.73)                   |
| <i>Analyst Experience</i>      | 0.168**<br>(2.60)                         | 14.549**<br>(2.19)               | 0.012*<br>(1.67)         | 0.009<br>(0.13)                        | 6.579**<br>(2.60)                   | 0.058**<br>(2.25)                   | 0.007<br>(0.40)                     |
| <i>#Firms Covered</i>          | 0.551***<br>(3.75)                        | 15.555**<br>(2.28)               | 0.057<br>(1.41)          | 0.317<br>(1.47)                        | 20.217*<br>(1.97)                   | 0.024<br>(0.24)                     | 0.046<br>(0.96)                     |
| <i>Broker Size</i>             | -0.003**<br>(-1.98)                       | -0.063<br>(-0.81)                | 0.000<br>(0.40)          | 0.003**<br>(2.22)                      | 0.082<br>(1.22)                     | -0.001*<br>(-1.96)                  | 0.001**<br>(2.01)                   |
| Analyst-Firm Fixed Effects     | Yes                                       | Yes                              | Yes                      | Yes                                    | Yes                                 | Yes                                 | Yes                                 |
| Firm-Year Fixed Effects        | Yes                                       | Yes                              | Yes                      | Yes                                    | Yes                                 | Yes                                 | Yes                                 |
| <i>N</i>                       | 5,831                                     | 5,831                            | 5,831                    | 2,007                                  | 2,007                               | 2,007                               | 2,007                               |
| Adjusted <i>R</i> <sup>2</sup> | 0.418                                     | 0.521                            | 0.475                    | 0.644                                  | 0.539                               | 0.095                               | 0.172                               |

Table A5  
How Much Incremental Insight Is There in Alternative Data? Results by Alternative Data Category

This table reports results from repeating the analysis tabulated in column (2) of Table 3, but we now estimate separate regressions for each indicator variable,  $I(\text{Category} = \_)$ . We report  $t$ -statistics in parentheses. We double-cluster our standard errors at the analyst- and year-month levels. \*, \*\*, and \*\*\* denote statistical significance at the 10%, 5%, and 1% level, respectively.

|   | (1)                | (2)                | (3)                | (4)             | (5)                | (6)             | (7)                | (8)                |
|---|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|-----------------|--------------------|-----------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| $I(\text{Category} = \text{App Usage})$       | 0.384***<br>(4.52) |                    |                    |                 |                    |                 |                    |                    |
| $I(\text{Category} = \text{Sentiment})$       |                    | 0.216***<br>(3.47) |                    |                 |                    |                 |                    |                    |
| $I(\text{Category} = \text{Employee})$        |                    |                    | 0.225***<br>(3.60) |                 |                    |                 |                    |                    |
| $I(\text{Category} = \text{Geospatial})$      |                    |                    |                    | 0.066<br>(0.63) |                    |                 |                    |                    |
| $I(\text{Category} = \text{Point of Sale})$   |                    |                    |                    |                 | 0.208***<br>(4.31) |                 |                    |                    |
| $I(\text{Category} = \text{Satellite Image})$ |                    |                    |                    |                 |                    | 0.135<br>(1.23) |                    |                    |
| $I(\text{Category} = \text{Web Traffic})$     |                    |                    |                    |                 |                    |                 | 0.183***<br>(3.08) |                    |
| $I(\text{Category} = \text{Others})$          |                    |                    |                    |                 |                    |                 |                    | 0.200***<br>(4.34) |

Table A5. Continued.

|                                | (1)                   | (2)                   | (3)                   | (4)                   | (5)                   | (6)                   | (7)                   | (8)                   |
|--------------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| <i>Forecast Age</i>            | -0.247***<br>(-12.22) | -0.248***<br>(-12.26) | -0.248***<br>(-12.21) | -0.248***<br>(-12.18) | -0.248***<br>(-12.18) | -0.248***<br>(-12.19) | -0.247***<br>(-12.24) | -0.248***<br>(-12.17) |
| <i>Analyst/Firm Experience</i> | 0.058***<br>(2.70)    | 0.059***<br>(2.79)    | 0.061***<br>(3.00)    | 0.059***<br>(2.81)    | 0.059***<br>(2.81)    | 0.059***<br>(2.81)    | 0.058***<br>(2.74)    | 0.058***<br>(2.76)    |
| <i>Analyst Experience</i>      | 0.065<br>(1.17)       | 0.064<br>(1.15)       | 0.062<br>(1.13)       | 0.065<br>(1.17)       | 0.063<br>(1.14)       | 0.065<br>(1.17)       | 0.065<br>(1.18)       | 0.065<br>(1.17)       |
| <i>#Firms Covered</i>          | 0.048<br>(0.97)       | 0.041<br>(0.80)       | 0.046<br>(0.91)       | 0.043<br>(0.86)       | 0.040<br>(0.79)       | 0.042<br>(0.85)       | 0.043<br>(0.86)       | 0.038<br>(0.59)       |
| <i>Forecast Frequency</i>      | 0.026<br>(0.84)       | 0.027<br>(0.89)       | 0.027<br>(0.86)       | 0.027<br>(0.87)       | 0.029<br>(0.95)       | 0.027<br>(0.87)       | 0.026<br>(0.85)       | 0.030<br>(0.76)       |
| <i>Broker Size</i>             | -0.001<br>(-1.07)     | -0.001<br>(-1.05)     | -0.000<br>(-0.94)     | -0.001<br>(-1.00)     | -0.001<br>(-0.99)     | -0.001<br>(-1.00)     | -0.001<br>(-1.05)     | -0.001<br>(-1.01)     |
| Analyst-Firm Fixed Effects     | Yes                   | Yes                   | Yes                   | Yes                   | Yes                   | Yes                   | Yes                   | Yes                   |
| Firm-Year Fixed Effects        | Yes                   | Yes                   | Yes                   | Yes                   | Yes                   | Yes                   | Yes                   | Yes                   |
| <i>N</i>                       | 64,036                | 64,036                | 64,036                | 64,036                | 64,036                | 64,036                | 64,036                | 64,036                |
| Adjusted <i>R</i> <sup>2</sup> | 0.229                 | 0.228                 | 0.228                 | 0.228                 | 0.228                 | 0.228                 | 0.229                 | 0.229                 |

Table A6  
How Much Incremental Insight Is There in Alternative Data?  
Simultaneously Drawing From Multiple Categories and Differences in Data Source

This table reports results from repeating the analysis tabulated in column (1) of Table 3, but we now replace  $I(\text{Alternative Data})$  with  $\sum \text{Categories}$  in column (1), which is the number of different alternative data categories the corresponding analyst explicitly relies on. In column (2), we replace  $I(\text{Alternative Data})$  with  $I(\text{Source} = \text{In-House Data Science Team})$  and  $I(\text{Source} = \text{Data Vendor})$ , which equal one if the corresponding analyst explicitly references the use of alternative data and the referenced source is an in-house data science team and an external vendor, respectively.  $I(\text{Source} = \text{Unknown})$  equals one if the corresponding analyst explicitly references the use of alternative data but does not state the source. The results in column (1) are based the subset of forecasts explicitly supported by alternative data. We report  $t$ -statistics in parentheses. We double-cluster our standard errors at the analyst- and year-month levels. \*, \*\*, and \*\*\* denote statistical significance at the 10%, 5%, and 1% level, respectively.

|  | (1)                  | (2)                   |
|--|----------------------|-----------------------|
| $\sum \text{Categories}$                               | 0.176*<br>(1.77)     |                       |
| $I(\text{Source} = \text{In-House Data Science Team})$ |                      | 0.260***<br>(3.52)    |
| $I(\text{Source} = \text{Data Vendor})$                |                      | 0.179***<br>(3.34)    |
| $I(\text{Source} = \text{Unknown})$                    |                      | 0.184***<br>(5.06)    |
| <i>Forecast Age</i>                                    | -0.180***<br>(-3.70) | -0.246***<br>(-12.36) |
| <i>Analyst/Firm Experience</i>                         | -0.017<br>(-1.25)    | 0.058***<br>(2.79)    |
| <i>Analyst Experience</i>                              | 0.386<br>(1.54)      | 0.059<br>(1.08)       |
| <i>#Firms Covered</i>                                  | -0.277<br>(-1.05)    | 0.041<br>(0.81)       |
| <i>Forecast Frequency</i>                              | -0.090<br>(-0.87)    | 0.027<br>(0.97)       |
| <i>Broker Size</i>                                     | 0.004<br>(1.51)      | -0.000<br>(-0.95)     |
| Analyst-Firm Fixed Effects                             | Yes                  | Yes                   |
| Firm-Year Fixed Effects                                | Yes                  | Yes                   |
| $N$  | 5,639                | 64,036                |
| Adjusted $R^2$   | 0.371                | 0.232                 |

Table A7  
How Much Incremental Insight Is There in Alternative Data? The Role of Learning

This table reports coefficient estimates from regression of forecast accuracy on variables reflecting an analyst's level of expertise working with alternative data. The observations are at the analyst/firm/report-date level. The regressions are identical to that in column (1) of Table 3 except for that we replace  $I(\text{Alternative Data})$  with  $\sum \text{Revisions}_{\text{Alternative Data}}$ , which is the number of previous forecasts revisions supported by alternative data. We report  $t$ -statistics in parentheses. We double-cluster our standard errors at the analyst- and year-month levels. \*, \*\*, and \*\*\* denote statistical significance at the 10%, 5%, and 1% level, respectively.

|   | Learning from<br>Past Experience |
|---|----------------------------------|
| $\sum \text{Revisions}_{\text{Alternative Data}}$ | 0.053***<br>(4.07)               |
| <i>Forecast Age</i>                               | -0.147***<br>(-3.28)             |
| <i>Analyst/Firm Experience</i>                    | -0.002<br>(-0.14)                |
| <i>Analyst Experience</i>                         | 0.310<br>(1.32)                  |
| <i>#Firms Covered</i>                             | -0.236<br>(-0.79)                |
| <i>Forecast Frequency</i>                         | -0.052<br>(-0.50)                |
| <i>Broker Size</i>                                | 0.004<br>(1.55)                  |
| Analyst-Firm Fixed Effects                        | Yes                              |
| Firm-Year Fixed Effects                           | Yes                              |
| $N$   | 5,639                            |
| Adjusted $R^2$                                    | 0.393                            |

Table A8  
How Much Incremental Insight Is There in Alternative Data? The Role of Learning by Alternative Data Category

This table reports results from repeating the analysis tabulated in Online Appendix Table A7, but we now compute the number of forecasts revisions explicitly supported by alternative data from a particular category,  $\sum Revisions_{Category}$ . We report  $t$ -statistics in parentheses. We double-cluster our standard errors at the analyst- and firm levels. \*, \*\*, and \*\*\* denote statistical significance at the 10%, 5%, and 1% level, respectively.

|                                    | (1)             | (2)             | (3)              | (4)               | (5)             | (6)                | (7)               | (8)              |
|------------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|------------------|-------------------|-----------------|--------------------|-------------------|------------------|
| $\sum Revisions_{App Usage}$       | 0.121<br>(1.29) |                 |                  |                   |                 |                    |                   |                  |
| $\sum Revisions_{Sentiment}$       |                 | 0.041<br>(0.91) |                  |                   |                 |                    |                   |                  |
| $\sum Revisions_{Employee}$        |                 |                 | 0.111*<br>(1.78) |                   |                 |                    |                   |                  |
| $\sum Revisions_{Geospatial}$      |                 |                 |                  | -0.123<br>(-1.39) |                 |                    |                   |                  |
| $\sum Revisions_{Point of Sale}$   |                 |                 |                  |                   | 0.051<br>(0.74) |                    |                   |                  |
| $\sum Revisions_{Satellite Image}$ |                 |                 |                  |                   |                 | 0.257***<br>(6.51) |                   |                  |
| $\sum Revisions_{Web Traffic}$     |                 |                 |                  |                   |                 |                    | 0.033**<br>(2.31) |                  |
| $\sum Revisions_{Others}$          |                 |                 |                  |                   |                 |                    |                   | 0.044*<br>(1.69) |



Table A8. Continued.

|                                | (1)                | (2)                  | (3)                  | (4)                 | (5)                | (6)               | (7)                | (8)                 |
|--------------------------------|--------------------|----------------------|----------------------|---------------------|--------------------|-------------------|--------------------|---------------------|
| <i>Forecast Age</i>            | 0.148***<br>(3.09) | 0.124**<br>(2.22)    | 0.122**<br>(2.32)    | 0.017<br>(0.36)     | 0.025<br>(0.63)    | 0.043<br>(1.04)   | 0.200***<br>(3.80) | 0.063*<br>(1.72)    |
| <i>Analyst/Firm Experience</i> | 2.415**<br>(2.52)  | 8.036***<br>(5.56)   | 0.859***<br>(6.31)   | 1.009<br>(0.84)     | -1.204<br>(-1.19)  | 0.037<br>(0.27)   | 1.881<br>(0.92)    | -0.039<br>(-0.06)   |
| <i>Analyst Experience</i>      | -1.238<br>(-1.62)  | -6.412***<br>(-5.64) | 0.132<br>(0.39)      | -0.088<br>(-0.10)   | 2.342***<br>(2.78) | 0.597<br>(0.84)   | 0.490<br>(0.25)    | 1.192<br>(1.60)     |
| <i>#Firms Covered</i>          | 0.411**<br>(2.06)  | -0.577<br>(-1.65)    | -4.907***<br>(-8.54) | 1.400*<br>(2.05)    | -0.502<br>(-0.50)  | -1.791<br>(-1.41) | -0.220<br>(-0.32)  | 3.141**<br>(2.47)   |
| <i>Forecast Frequency</i>      | -0.808*<br>(-1.90) | 0.351*<br>(1.80)     | 0.819***<br>(8.71)   | -0.252**<br>(-2.67) | 0.071<br>(0.22)    | 0.005<br>(0.04)   | 0.052<br>(0.29)    | -0.601**<br>(-2.12) |
| <i>Broker Size</i>             | -0.015<br>(-1.62)  | -0.002<br>(-0.78)    | -0.016**<br>(-2.17)  | -0.018**<br>(-2.58) | 0.001<br>(0.30)    | -0.019<br>(-0.87) | 0.012*<br>(1.87)   | -0.010<br>(-1.16)   |
| Analyst-Firm Fixed Effects     | Yes                | Yes                  | Yes                  | Yes                 | Yes                | Yes               | Yes                | Yes                 |
| Firm-Year Fixed Effects        | Yes                | Yes                  | Yes                  | Yes                 | Yes                | Yes               | Yes                | Yes                 |
| <i>N</i>                       | 476                | 1,062                | 543                  | 257                 | 1,080              | 171               | 1,944              | 1,322               |
| Adjusted $R^2$                 | 0.523              | 0.548                | 0.683                | 0.695               | 0.512              | 0.795             | 0.531              | 0.489               |

Table A9 Alternative Data and Stock Market Reactions in the Medium- and Long-run

This table repeats the analysis in Table 6 over medium- and long horizons. [2, 5] reflects the abnormal return summed from the second trading day after the revision to five trading days after the revision, that is, roughly one calendar week after the revision. [2, 21] reflects the abnormal return summed from the second trading day after the revision to 21 trading days after the revision, that is, roughly one calendar month after the revision. [2, 63] reflects the abnormal return summed from the second trading day after the revision to 63 trading days after the revision, that is, roughly three calendar months after the revision. [2, 252] reflects the abnormal return summed from the second trading day after the revision to 252 trading days after the revision, that is, roughly one calendar year after the revision. We report  $t$ -statistics in parentheses. We double-cluster our standard errors at the analyst- and year-month levels. \*, \*\*, and \*\*\* denote statistical significance at the 10%, 5%, and 1% level, respectively.

|  | [2, 5]              |                     | [2, 21]              |                       | [2, 63]              |                      | [2, 252]             |                       |
|--|---------------------|---------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|----------------------|----------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|
|  | (1)                 | (2)                 | (3)                  | (4)                   | (5)                  | (6)                  | (7)                  | (8)                   |
| <i>Panel A: Earnings Forecast Change</i>   |                     |                     |                      |                       |                      |                      |                      |                       |
| $I(\text{Alternative Data}) \times \Delta$ | -7.318**<br>(-2.48) | -6.537**<br>(-2.34) | -16.598**<br>(-2.34) | -14.554***<br>(-2.63) | -30.037**<br>(-2.22) | -16.969**<br>(-2.00) | -58.857**<br>(-2.02) | -6.775<br>(-0.70)     |
| $\Delta$                                   | -0.101<br>(-0.14)   | -0.487<br>(-0.73)   | 0.411<br>(0.19)      | -1.864<br>(-1.12)     | 1.510<br>(0.35)      | -9.028***<br>(-3.06) | 5.641<br>(0.53)      | -16.737***<br>(-4.04) |
| $I(\text{Alternative Data})$               | 0.069<br>(1.45)     | 0.075<br>(1.47)     | 0.303**<br>(2.25)    | 0.355**<br>(2.42)     | 0.898***<br>(2.66)   | 0.182<br>(0.50)      | 2.610**<br>(2.01)    | -0.183<br>(-0.38)     |
| Firm Characteristics Controls              | Yes                 | No                  | Yes                  | No                    | Yes                  | No                   | Yes                  | No                    |
| Other Controls                             | Yes                 | Yes                 | Yes                  | Yes                   | Yes                  | Yes                  | Yes                  | Yes                   |
| Analyst-Firm Fixed Effects                 | No                  | Yes                 | No                   | Yes                   | No                   | Yes                  | No                   | Yes                   |
| Firm-Year Fixed Effects                    | No                  | Yes                 | No                   | Yes                   | No                   | Yes                  | No                   | Yes                   |
| $N$  | 37,955              | 37,955              | 37,955               | 37,955                | 37,955               | 37,955               | 37,955               | 37,955                |
| Adjusted $R^2$                             | 0.022               | 0.047               | 0.037                | 0.122                 | 0.029                | 0.271                | 0.012                | 0.708                 |

Table A9. Continued.

|  | [2, 5]               |                    | [2, 21]              |                      | [2, 63]              |                       | [2, 252]           |                        |
|--|----------------------|--------------------|----------------------|----------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|--------------------|------------------------|
|  | (1)                  | (2)                | (3)                  | (4)                  | (5)                  | (6)                   | (7)                | (8)                    |
| <i>Panel B: Target Price Change</i>        |                      |                    |                      |                      |                      |                       |                    |                        |
| $I(\text{Alternative Data}) \times \Delta$ | 0.358<br>(0.28)      | 0.147<br>(0.13)    | 1.836<br>(0.80)      | 1.966<br>(0.95)      | -3.487<br>(-0.81)    | -1.122<br>(-0.33)     | -10.763<br>(-0.89) | -0.772<br>(-0.13)      |
| $\Delta$                                   | -1.959***<br>(-4.29) | -0.847*<br>(-1.90) | -4.449***<br>(-3.98) | -3.829***<br>(-4.21) | -7.528***<br>(-3.92) | -13.045***<br>(-8.57) | -7.307*<br>(-1.79) | -23.171***<br>(-10.04) |
| $I(\text{Alternative Data})$               | 0.059<br>(1.15)      | 0.059<br>(1.08)    | 0.265*<br>(1.93)     | 0.315*<br>(1.97)     | 0.789**<br>(2.30)    | 0.119<br>(0.31)       | 2.057<br>(1.57)    | -0.339<br>(-0.64)      |
| Firm Characteristics Controls              | Yes                  | No                 | Yes                  | No                   | Yes                  | No                    | Yes                | No                     |
| Other Controls                             | Yes                  | Yes                | Yes                  | Yes                  | Yes                  | Yes                   | Yes                | Yes                    |
| Analyst-Firm Fixed Effects                 | No                   | Yes                | No                   | Yes                  | No                   | Yes                   | No                 | Yes                    |
| Firm-Year Fixed Effects                    | No                   | Yes                | No                   | Yes                  | No                   | Yes                   | No                 | Yes                    |
| $N$  | 34,697               | 34,697             | 34,697               | 34,697               | 34,697               | 34,697                | 34,697             | 34,697                 |
| Adjusted $R^2$                             | 0.022                | 0.046              | 0.036                | 0.120                | 0.028                | 0.272                 | 0.011              | 0.704                  |

Table A9. Continued.

|  | [2, 5]          |                 | [2, 21]           |                   | [2, 63]             |                     | [2, 252]          |                   |
|--|-----------------|-----------------|-------------------|-------------------|---------------------|---------------------|-------------------|-------------------|
|  | (1)             | (2)             | (3)               | (4)               | (5)                 | (6)                 | (7)               | (8)               |
| <i>Panel C: Recommendation Change</i>      |                 |                 |                   |                   |                     |                     |                   |                   |
| $I(\text{Alternative Data}) \times \Delta$ | 0.170<br>(0.55) | 0.148<br>(0.54) | 0.095<br>(0.18)   | -0.079<br>(-0.17) | -1.243<br>(-1.10)   | -1.799*<br>(-1.72)  | -0.303<br>(-0.14) | -2.043<br>(-1.49) |
| $\Delta$                                   | 0.001<br>(0.02) | 0.013<br>(0.17) | -0.214<br>(-1.25) | -0.225<br>(-1.44) | -0.657**<br>(-2.19) | -0.669**<br>(-2.28) | -0.389<br>(-0.64) | 0.201<br>(0.55)   |
| $I(\text{Alternative Data})$               | 0.077<br>(1.54) | 0.063<br>(1.14) | 0.303**<br>(2.31) | 0.337**<br>(2.14) | 0.914***<br>(2.66)  | 0.256<br>(0.66)     | 2.416*<br>(1.80)  | -0.101<br>(-0.20) |
| Firm Characteristics Controls              | Yes             | No              | Yes               | No                | Yes                 | No                  | Yes               | No                |
| Other Controls                             | Yes             | Yes             | Yes               | Yes               | Yes                 | Yes                 | Yes               | Yes               |
| Analyst-Firm Fixed Effects                 | No              | Yes             | No                | Yes               | No                  | Yes                 | No                | Yes               |
| Firm-Year Fixed Effects                    | No              | Yes             | No                | Yes               | No                  | Yes                 | No                | Yes               |
| $N$  | 37,848          | 37,848          | 37,848            | 37,848            | 37,848              | 37,848              | 37,848            | 37,848            |
| Adjusted $R^2$                             | 0.020           | 0.044           | 0.035             | 0.116             | 0.029               | 0.265               | 0.012             | 0.697             |